

Philosophy and Kalam

Semi-Annual Academic Journal

Faculty of Theology & Islamic Studies

University of Tehran

New Period, Vol. 50, No. 2, Autumn & Winter 2017/2018

Copyright Holder: Faculty of Theology & Islamic Studies of University of Tehran

Managing Director: Majid Maarif

Editor-in-Chief: Abd al-Rasul Kashfi

English Editor: Abd al-Rasul Kashfi

Persian Editor: Mahdi Azimi

Editorial Board:

Gholam Reza Awani	Professor, Iranian Institute of hilosophy (Iran)
Ahmad Beheshti	Professor, University of Tehran (Iran)
Vincent Brummer	Professor, Utrecht University (Netherlands)
Qorban Elmi	Associate Professor, University of Tehran (Iran)
Amir Abbas Alizamani	Associate Professor, University of Tehran (Iran)
Ahad Faramarz Qaramaleki	Professor, University of Tehran (Iran)
Najafqoli Habibi	Associate Professor, University of Tehran (Iran)
Mohsen Jawadi	Associate Professor, Qom University (Iran)
Abd al-Rasul Kashfi	Associate Professor, University of Tehran (Iran)
Muhammad Legenhausen	Professor, Research Institute of Imam Khomeini (Iran)
Hossein Hooshangi	Associate Professor, Imam Sadiq University
Seyyed Yahya Yathrebi	Professor, Allameh Tabatabayi University (Iran)

- **Design and Typesetting:** Azar Aghamirza
- **Layout:** zeynab mirazizi
- **Published by:** University of Tehran
- **Address:** Faculty of Theology & Islamic Studies, Motahhari St., Tehran, Iran
- **P.O.B:** 15766 – 4411
- **Website:** jitp.ut.ac.ir
- **Email:** jitp@ut.ac.ir
- **Phone:** 098-021-42762151
- **Fax:** 42762951

“Philosophy and Kalam” has been licensed as a scientific research semi-annual academic journal since October the 11th, 2010 by the Commission for Evaluation of Iranian Scientific Journals, The Ministry of Science, Research and Technology through the letter numbered 3/11/2795

**“Philosophy and Kalam” has been indexed in international website of “Philosopher’s Index” since June the 13th, 2012. All the articles of this journal and their abstracts can be accessed through this website. The website address is:
<http://philindex.org>**

**Philosophy and Kalam can be accessed through the following domestic websites:
www.isc.gov.ir
www.SID.ir
www.noormags.com
www.magiran.com
<http://journals.ut.ac.ir>**

Submission Guidelines:

- 1. All essays submitted for publication should be based on scholarly research representing new ideas in the fields of philosophy and Kalam. Review articles on new topics in philosophy and Kalam and book reviews are also recommended. Book reviews must include title, publisher, city of publication, and year of publication of the book.**
- 2. The essays should not already be published in another journal.**
- 3. The Editorial Board reserves the right to accept or reject the essays, to make all editorial changes as deemed necessary, and to rearrange the articles in the order which it finds appropriate.**
- 4. Submissions should not exceed 6000 words and must include title, introduction, literature review, essay body, conclusion, references, two abstracts (preferably less than 150 words each, in Farsi and English), and two lists of keywords (in Farsi and English).**
- 5. The accepted file format is Microsoft Word 2010, with single line spacing and font size of 12. All submissions are made online at the journal website: <http://jitp.ut.ac.ir>.**
- 6. The list of references at the end of article should appear in alphabetical order and follow the Modern Language Association (MLA) style as follows:**
 - a. To quote: give the author's surname, date of publication and page number in parenthesis, right after the quotation. In case the author you are quoting from has more than one publication in the year you are referring to, distinguish them by writing a, b, c, etc. after the date.**
 - b. In case of books: author's surname, first name, title in italics, translator's name, place of publication, publisher name, date of publication.**
 - c. In case of articles: author's surname, first name, title, journal name in italics, date of publication, issue no., vol. no., page no.**
 - d. In case of Internet sources: author's surname, first name, date of article, article title, journal title, vol.(issue), pages, date information retrieved, from URL.**

Abstracts

In

English

Contents

A Reflection on Extracting Multiple Concepts from an Indivisible Essence	1
<i>Mohammad Bonyani, Ali Rahimi</i>	
Ja'l and Wujud: A Reflection on the Mirdamad's View	3
<i>Davood Hosseini</i>	
The Existence-as-Fluid Metaphor in Mulla Sadra's Philosophy	5
<i>Vahid Khademzadeh</i>	
The Ghias al-Din Mansour Dashtaki's View: Unity of Intuition or Unity of Existence	7
<i>Elahe Zare, Abbas Javareshkian, Sayyed Morteza Hosseini Shahroudi, Ghasem Kakaei</i>	
The Purpose Theory as the Evidence of Psychological Egoism in the Mulla Sadra's Philosophy	9
<i>Abdollah Salavati</i>	
Semantical Implication and Conceptual Implication	11
<i>Ahmad Ebadi</i>	
Abhari's Logic in <i>Bayan al-Asrar</i>	13
<i>Mahdi Azimi</i>	
Allame Tabatabaei's Views on the Unity of Divine Attributes and God's Simplicity	15
<i>Sayyid Shahriyar Kamaali Sabzewari, Mohammad Saeedimehr</i>	

A Reflection on Extracting Multiple Concepts from an Indivisible Essence

Mohammad Bonyani¹, Ali Rahimi²

(Received: 26 February 2017 – Accepted 19 July 2017)

Abstract

The difficulty of extracting multiple concepts from an indivisible essence is one of the main motivations of interest to negative theology. On the other side, believing in the identity of the essence and attributes of God without clarifying the nature of ascribing of attributes to God's essence is not precise, too. In spite of the variety of solutions to this issue, it seems no one is satisfiable. In this paper, after examining these solutions, we will show that, according to the fact that God is the origin and source of all perfections and the fact that the grantor does not lack the thing he grants, we can ascribe the attributes purified from defects to God although we don't know the nature of this ascription.

Keywords: Negative Theology, Indivisible Essence, God's Attributes

1. Associate Professor of Philosophy, Shiraz University (Corresponding Author);
Email: m.bonyani@gmail.com

2. PHD student of Philosophy, Shiraz university; Email: a.r93933@yahoo.com

Ja'l and Wujud: A Reflection on the Mirdamad's View

Davood Hosseini¹

(Received: 19 May 2017 – Accepted 19 July 2017)

Abstract

Mirdamad argues, in some details, for a series of theses on *wujud* (existence) and *ja'l* (creation): first, *wujud* (existence) is not a property of anything; second, it is nothing but *al-mojudiah al-masdariah* (to-be-existent); third, what is created is *mahiyah* (quiddity) and not existence or quiddity's being existent; fourth, the resultant of creation is *tagharor al-mahiyah* (the subsistence of quiddity) and not its existence; and fifth, there are two non-equivalent simple-if questions, real (the question of subsistence) and commonly accepted (the question of existence). In this paper, the main question is how Mirdamad's multidimensional theory about existence, subsistence, creation, and quiddity can be sustained coherently. We will show that the whole picture Mirdamad draws cannot be maintained coherently. A qualification will be proposed according to which in the language of metaphysics, there is nothing but creation and quiddity.

Keywords: Wujud (Existence), *ja'l* (creation), *tagharor* (subsistence), Simple-If Question

1. Assistant Professor of Philosophy, Tarbiat Modares University;
Email: davood.hosseini@modares.ac.ir.

The Existence-as-Fluid Metaphor in Mulla Sadra's Philosophy

Vahid Khademzadeh¹

(Received: 27 December 2016 - Accepted 19 July 2017)

Abstract

In cognitive metaphor theory, abstract concepts are understood by conceptual metaphors so that by removing these metaphors, these concepts are not understandable. Given this theory, *wujud* (existence), as one of the most important concepts in Mulla Sadra's philosophy, is understood by several conceptual metaphors. Existence-as-fluid metaphor maps the properties of the fluid on the existence in metaphysics. The fluid is not able to keep its body shape, but conforms to the shape of its container; so, the fluid is seen as continuous and integrated matter. These two properties play an important role in the conceptualization of the existential unity. In the theory of existential unity, creation of the universe is described by the flow and expansion of existence. The two terms are also rooted in the understanding of existence as a fluid.

Keywords: Mulla Sadra, Conceptual Metaphor, Existence, Existential Unity

1. Assistant Professor, Ferdowsi University of Mashhad; Email: v.khademzadeh@um.ac.ir.

The Ghias al-Din Mansour Dashtaki's View: Unity of Intuition or Unity of Existence

**Elahe Zare¹, Abbas Javareshkian²,
Sayyed Morteza Hosseini Shahroudi³, Ghasem Kakaei⁴**

(Received: 4 February 2017 - Accepted 19 July 2017)

Abstract

Some the opponents of the theory of "Unity of Existence" is completely rejecting it, and some have some interpretation of it. Ghias ad-Din Mansour Dashtaki is one of those who interpreted it as the "Unity of intuition". It means that the mystic arrives in a state becoming unaware of all things but God. However, one can find, in his works, cases he defends the unity of existence too. We can conclude that his prevailing theory is the unity of intuition, and his confusion between the unity of existence and unity of intuition is the result of some matters such as his failing to distinguish between different views, being influenced by the dispute occurred between him and Jalal al-Din Dawani and his try to deal with the ignorant Sufis of his time.

Keywords: Ghias al-Din Mansour Dashtaki, Jalal al-Din Dawani, Unity of Existence, Unity of Intuition

-
1. Ph.D. Candidate of Transcendent Philosophy (al-Hikmat al-Muta'aliah), University of Mashhad, Iran; Email: elahezare@gmail.com.
 2. Associate Professor, University of Mashhad, Iran. (Corresponding Author); Email: javareshki@um.ac.ir
 3. Professor, University of Mashhad, Iran; Email: shahrudi@um.ac.ir.
 4. Professor of Islamic Philosophy and Theology, University of Shiraz, Iran; Email: gkakaie@rose.shirazu.ac.ir.

The Purpose Theory as the Evidence of Psychological Egoism in the Mulla Sadra's Philosophy

Abdollah Salavati¹

(Received: 8 April 2017 – Accepted 19 July 2017)

Abstract

There are several versions of psychological egoism, and each emphasizes some specific issue. This issue, in the Ayn's version, is the reflection of the subject's benefit to him. In Pojman's version, it is the reflection of the subject's satisfaction to him. In Richards's remark, selfishness, and in Holmes's statement, motivation and self-love have been emphasized. All the aforementioned elements are present in the Mulla Sadra's philosophy; as, in his explanation of the purpose theory, he speaks of self-love and the reflection of all purposes to the subject. The main question is: is, in the Mulla Sadra's philosophy, the reflection of all purposes to the subject and self-love in favor of psychological egoism? The findings are: considering concepts such as purpose (in its general meaning), motivation (in its particular sense), selfishness and virtue, one can say the Sadra's Philosophy is not in favor of the theory of psychological egoism.

Keywords: Mulla Sadra, Psychological Egoism, Ethical Egoism, Ethics of Virtue, Purpose

1. Assistant professor in Shahid Rajaei Teacher Training University;
Email:a.salavati@srttu.edu.

Semantical Implication and Conceptual Implication

Ahmad Ebadi¹

(Received: 3 April 2016 – Accepted 19 July 2017)

Abstract

Usuli experts' theory of conceptual implication, on one hand, and the linguistic philosophers' theory of semantical implication, on the other, can be the subject of a comparative study. Theory of conceptual implication is the basis of the semantic approach. Conceptual implication is the transfer of mind from a term to its meaning regardless of the speaker's intention. Judicial implication is the transfer of mind from a term to the speaker's intended meaning. Semantics is closer to the theory of conceptual implication because semantics is the study of meaning independent of the speaker or author's intention. Pragmatics is closer to theory of judicial implication because pragmatics is the study of meaning based on the speaker or author's intention. Of all theories of semantical signification, the use theory of meaning is closer to the theory of conceptual implication because according to both theories, language and the use of terms are socially rule-governed activities. What's more, both theories claim that phrases and terms acquire their meaning through their multiple usages and functions in society.

Keywords: Conceptual Implication, Judicial Implication, Semantics, *Usul al-fiqh* (Principles of Jurisprudence)

1. Assistant Professor of Islamic Philosophy and Theology, University of Isfahan;
Email: a.ebadi@ahl.ui.ac.ir.

Abhari's Logic in *Bayan al-Asrar*

Mahdi Azimi¹

(Received: 26 December 2016 – Accepted 19 July 2017)

Abstract

Athir al-Abhari (d. ca. 656/1258) was an outstanding Iranian polymath who wrote numerous treatises, as *Bayan al-Asrar*, *Talkhis al-Haqa'iq*, *Risalat al-Matali'*, and *Zubdat al-Haqa'iq*. Each treatise contains three subjects: logic, physics, and metaphysics copied by Katibi al-Qazwini. Al-Abhari has written his *ijaza* at the beginning of each of the treatises. The four are preserved in MS Fazil Ahmed Pasha, 1618, in the Library of Kuprili, Istanbul. In this study, I have edited and introduced the Logic of *Bayan al-Asrar*. Abhari's logic in this work is purely Avicennan.

Keywords: Athir al-Abhari, *Bayan al-Asrar*, MS Fazil Ahmed Pasha 1618, al-Abhar's Logic.

1. Assistant Professor of University of Tehran;

Email: mahdiazimi@ut.ac.ir.

Allame Tabatabaei's Views on the Unity of Divine Attributes and God's Simplicity

Sayyid Shahriyar Kamaali Sabzewari¹, Mohammad Saeedimehr²

(Received: 22 October 2016 – Accepted 19 July 2017)

Abstract

Muslim philosophers, including Mulla Sadra, commonly advocate the theory of “the conceptual difference and existential identity of Divine attributes”. Muslim mystics, however, hold that the attribution of Divine attributes is posterior to His essence and that the very essence transcends any attribute or name. Allame Tabatabaei supports the former theory in his *Nahaya al-Hikmah* but in some other works like *Al-Mizan*, sees the latter as the correct one. In this paper, we argue that the first view leads to an implausible result, namely the composition of the Divine attributes from existence and non-existence. Then, appealing to the dichotomy of *haqiqah/raqiqah* predication we propose a way to reconcile between the two apparently incompatible views of Tabatabaei.

Keywords: Allameh Tabatabaei, The unity of Divine attributes, Divine simplicity, *haqiqah/raqiqah* predication

1. Ph.D Student, Tarbiat Modares University; Email: shahriarkamali@yahoo.com.
2. Professor of Philosophy, Tarbiat Modares University (Corresponding Author);
Email: saeedimehr@yahoo.com.